SECOND REGULAR SESSION

SENATE BILL NO. 976

98TH GENERAL ASSEMBLY

INTRODUCED BY SENATOR NASHEED.

Read 1st time January 25, 2016, and ordered printed.

5202S.04I

ADRIANE D. CROUSE, Secretary.

AN ACT

To repeal section 590.650, RSMo, and to enact in lieu thereof one new section relating to racial bias in policing.

Be it enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Missouri, as follows:

Section A. Section 590.650, RSMo, is repealed and one new section 2 enacted in lieu thereof, to be known as section 590.650, to read as follows:

590.650. 1. As used in this section, the following terms mean:

- 2 (1) "Benchmark", the percentage of a given population within the 3 larger population, be it residential, driving, or some other measured 4 population;
- 5 (2) "Biased policing", occurs in circumstances in which the peace
- 6 officer's actions were based in whole or in part on the race, ethnicity,
- 7 gender, age, religious beliefs, disabilities, English language proficiency,
- 8 or national origin of a person rather than upon lawful and appropriate
- 9 law enforcement procedures based on observed behavior or
- 10 facts. "Biased policing" does not include investigations of alleged
- 11 crimes when law enforcement must seek out suspects who match a
- 12 specifically delineated description;
- 13 (3) "Contraband", illegal drugs, guns, or other objects that may
 14 warrant an arrest:
- 15 (4) "Disparity index", the rate of any given activity such as stops,
- 16 searches, or arrests, for a given population as compared to the
- 17 benchmark for that population;
- 18 (5) "Hit rate", the rate of searches in which a peace officer finds
- 19 contraband. The hit rate is calculated by dividing the number of

- 20 searches that yield contraband by the total number of searches;
- 21 (6) "Law enforcement activity", the following activities by a peace 22 officer:
- 23 (a) Traffic stops;

42

43

44

- 24 **(b)** Pedestrian stops;
- 25 (c) Consensual or nonconsensual frisks or pat downs;
- (d) Consensual or nonconsensual searches of persons, property,
 or possessions, including vehicles;
- 28 (7) "Minority group" [means], individuals of Black or African American, 29 Hispanic or Latino, [Native American or] American Indian or Alaska 30 Native, Asian, or multiracial descent;
- 31 (8) "Pedestrian stops", any stop of an individual in a public space 32 in which a peace officer stops, frisks, or questions a person based upon 33 a claim by the peace officer of reasonable suspicion of unlawful 34 activity.
- 2. Every member of a law enforcement agency within the state of Missouri, including any civilian employee or party contracted by the law enforcement agency, is prohibited from engaging in biased policing.
- 3. Each time a peace officer stops a driver of a motor vehicle or 40 completes a pedestrian stop, that officer shall report the following 41 information to the law enforcement agency that employs the officer:
 - (1) The [age,] gender [and], race [or minority group], disability, English language proficiency, or national origin of the individual stopped as perceived by the peace officer;
 - (2) The [reasons for] time, date, location, and duration of the stop;
- 46 (3) Whether the person stopped resides in the jurisdiction in 47 which such person was stopped;
- 48 (4) The violations alleged to have been committed that led to the 49 stop;
- 50 (5) Whether a search was conducted as a result of the stop and the 51 probable cause or authority for the search, such as consent, inventory 52 search, the presence of a drug or alcohol odor, search incident to arrest 53 for an outstanding warrant or arrest for another charge, plain view 54 contraband, reasonable suspicion due to the presence of a weapon or 55 an alert by a police dog, electronic or chemical detection technology,

56 or another reason;

68

69

78

- 57 (6) Whether a frisk or pat down was conducted as a result of the 58 stop;
- [(4)] (7) If a search was conducted, [whether the individual consented to the search, the probable cause for the search,] whether the **body of the** person was searched, whether the person's property was searched, and the duration of the search;
- 63 (8) If a search was of a passenger in the vehicle, the perceived 64 race, gender, disability, English language proficiency, or national 65 origin of the passenger;
- [(5)] (9) Whether any contraband was discovered in the course of the search [and], the type of any contraband discovered, and the amount;
 - (10) Whether canine units or electronic or chemical detection technology, excluding breathalyzers, were involved in the search;
- 70 [(6)] (11) Whether any warning or citation was issued as a result of the 71 stop;
- 72 **[**(7)**] (12)** If a warning or citation was issued, the violation charged or 73 warning provided;
- 74 (13) Whether any physical force was used by or against a peace 75 officer or officers and, if so, to what extent;
- 76 [(8)] (14) Whether an arrest was made as a result of either the stop or 77 the search; and
 - [(9)] (15) If an arrest was made, the crime charged[; and
- 79 (10) The location of the stop. [Such]
- Peace officers shall report to their agencies the information [may be reported] listed under this subsection using a format determined by the department of public safety [which uses existing citation and report forms].
 - [3. (1)] 4. Each law enforcement agency shall:
- (1) Compile [the] data [described in subsection 2 of this section for the calendar year into a report to] on the standardized form determined by the attorney general[.];
- 87 (2) [Each law enforcement agency shall] Submit the [report] form to the 88 attorney general no later than March first of [the following calendar] each 89 year[.];
- 90 (3) [The attorney general shall determine the format that all law 91 enforcement agencies shall use to submit the report] **Update the compiled**

105

106

107108

113

114

92 data and conspicuously publicize the data on the respective law 93 enforcement agency's website on a monthly basis;

- 94 (4) Maintain all data collected under this section for not less 95 than four years;
- 96 (5) Provide for the protection of the privacy of individuals whose 97 data is collected by not providing to the public the individual names 98 and identifying information regarding the particular peace officers who 99 made the stops and the pedestrians, drivers, and passengers who were 100 stopped.
- [4.] 5. (1) The attorney general shall analyze the annual reports of law enforcement agencies required by this section and submit a report of the findings to the governor, the general assembly and each law enforcement agency no later than June first of each year.
 - (2) The data analysis shall be completed using best practices and include meaningful benchmarks as appropriate for the type of population and appropriate for the geographic areas being analyzed, against which data shall be measured, which may include:
- 109 (a) Using race- and ethnicity-specific data about the residential population;
- 111 (b) Using a race- and ethnicity-specific spatial weighting data 112 analysis tool;
 - (c) Using race- and ethnicity-specific data about traffic accidents in which the driver is not found to be at fault;
- 115 (d) Using race- and ethnicity-specific data from observational 116 surveys of motorists;
- 117 (e) Using information gathered by peace officers about the 118 residency of the individuals stopped. This analysis shall be used only 119 in addition to one or more of the benchmarks listed in this subdivision; 120 or
- 121 (f) Using a combination of the benchmark measures listed in this 122 subdivision.
- 123 **(3)** The report of the attorney general shall include **statewide and**124 **agency-specific analyses of** at least the following information [for each
 125 agency]:
- 126 (a) The total number of vehicles stopped by peace officers during the 127 previous calendar year;
- 128 (b) The total number of pedestrians stopped by peace officers

129 during the previous calendar year;

- 130 (c) The number of vehicle and pedestrian stops, broken down by 131 the racial or ethnic group, meaning White, Black or African American, 132 Hispanic or Latino, American Indian or Alaska Native, Asian, 133 multiracial, other, or unknown;
- 134 (d) The number of vehicle stops that resulted in a search, broken 135 down by the probable cause or authority for the search and by the 136 driver's racial or ethnic group;
- 137 (e) The number of pedestrian stops that resulted in either a pat 138 down or search, broken down by racial or ethnic group;
- 139 (f) The disparity index regarding stopped pedestrians and 140 drivers for each racial or ethnic group, as determined using the 141 benchmark measures listed in subdivision (2) of this subsection;
- 142 (g) The disparity indices regarding consensual and 143 nonconsensual searches for pedestrians and drivers subjected to stops 144 for each racial or ethnic group, basing the benchmarks on the 145 population of those stopped;
- 146 (h) The disparity indices for each category of arrest for each 147 racial or ethnic group, basing the benchmarks on the population of 148 those stopped;
- 149 (i) The disparity indices in pat downs for pedestrians subject to 150 stops for each racial or ethnic group, basing the benchmarks on the 151 population of those stopped;
- 152 (j) A comparison of the racial or ethnic disparities in consent 153 searches to the consent search hit rate;
- [(b)] (k) The number and percentage of [stopped motor vehicles that were driven by members of each particular minority] traffic stops by the type of violation cited, such as moving, equipment, license, or investigatory, broken down by racial or ethnic group;
- [(c)] (l) A comparison of the [percentage of stopped motor vehicles driven by each minority group and the percentage of the state's population that each minority group comprises] racial or ethnic disparities in hit rates for all categories of probable cause or authority to search listed in the agency reports; and
- [(d)] (m) A compilation of the information reported by law enforcement agencies pursuant to subsection [2] 4 of this section.
- [5.] 6. (1) Each law enforcement agency shall [adopt a policy on

166 race-based traffic stops that:

177

178

179180

181

182

183184

185

186

187188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

- 167 (1) Prohibits the practice of routinely stopping members of minority 168 groups for violations of vehicle laws as a pretext for investigating other violations 169 of criminal law;
- 170 (2) Provides for periodic reviews by the law enforcement agency of the 171 annual report of the attorney general required by subsection 4 of this section 172 that:
- 173 (a) Determine whether any peace officers of the law enforcement agency 174 have a pattern of stopping members of minority groups for violations of vehicle 175 laws in a number disproportionate to the population of minority groups residing 176 or traveling within the jurisdiction of the law enforcement agency; and
 - (b) If the review reveals a pattern, require an investigation to determine whether any peace officers of the law enforcement agency routinely stop members of minority groups for violations of vehicle laws as a pretext for investigating other violations of criminal law; and
 - (3) Provides for appropriate counseling and training of any peace officer found to have engaged in race-based traffic stops within ninety days of the review. The course or courses of instruction and the guidelines shall stress understanding and respect for racial and cultural differences, and development of effective, noncombative methods of carrying out law enforcement duties in a racially and culturally diverse environment] ensure there is an annual review of the data collected by their peace officers under subsection 3 of this section and the annual report of the attorney general required by subsection 5 of this section. Such review shall determine whether individual officers in the agency, or the agency as a whole, have a pattern of stopping, searching, or arresting members of minority groups:
 - (a) In a number disproportionate to the population of minority groups residing, traveling, or being stopped within the jurisdiction of the law enforcement agency, using the benchmark measures described in subsection 5 of this section;
 - (b) In a number disproportionate to similarly situated peace officers; and
- 199 (c) Whether any peace officers of the law enforcement agency 200 routinely stop members of minority groups for violations of vehicle 201 laws as a pretext for investigating other violations of criminal law.

202 (2) If the review reveals a pattern of disparity, either 203 systemically or for individual officers, the agency shall require an 204 investigation to determine whether the agency or any peace officers of 205 the agency routinely engage in biased policing. The review shall 206 examine factors that might be a contributing factor to the disparity 207 such as:

- (a) Situations in which matters of fact establish that the officers are acting in a bias-free manner, such as hit rates that confirm that officer suspicions were accurate, investigations in which suspects were clearly identified without regard to minority status before the stop as being involved in criminal activity, radar stops on an Interstate highway;
 - (b) Unclear or misunderstood policies;

214

216

- 215 (c) Unclear instructions from supervisors;
 - (d) Training that has failed to teach the required skills.
- 217 (3) The agency shall issue a report to the public explaining the 218 results of the investigation, including whether some results establish 219 the extent to which some disproportions are affected by factors other 220 than officer bias.
- 221 (4) The agency shall correct any problems revealed by the review 222 and the investigation and provide for appropriate counseling and 223 training of any peace officer found to have engaged in biased policing 224 within ninety days of the review. The officer shall be removed from 225 patrol duties until completion of training and counseling.
- 226 (5) Officers that persist in biased policing shall be subject to discipline, up to and including dismissal.
- 7. Each law enforcement agency shall promulgate internal policies, including:
 - (1) A stated prohibition on bias in policing;
- 231 (2) Provisions for training on biased policing as described in 232 subsection 9 of this section;
- 233 (3) Procedures aimed at decreasing biased policing in the 234 administration of consent searches, which shall include the following 235 provisions:
- 236 (a) A peace officer may only seek consent to search when he or 237 she has reasonable suspicion based on specific, articulable facts for 238 conducting such search;

247

248249

250

251

252

272

273274

- 239 (b) The peace officer shall document in writing such specific, 240 articulable facts about the individual involved for conducting a consent 241 search. The written documentation shall also include the results of the 242 search;
- (c) Prior to conducting a consensual search of a person or the person's effects, a peace officer shall articulate in plain language that the person is being asked to voluntarily consent to a search and the person has the right to refuse the request to search;
 - (d) After providing such advisement, a peace officer shall request, in plain language, that the person subject to the search provide voluntary written consent to the search;
 - (e) Whether the person subject to search provides written consent. A peace officer may conduct the search if the person provided voluntary consent in a form other than in writing;
- 253 (f) Any evidence obtained as a result of a search prohibited by 254 this section shall be inadmissible in any judicial proceeding; and
- 255 (g) Nothing contained in this subsection shall be construed to 256 preclude any search otherwise based upon any legally sufficient cause; 257 and
- 258 (4) Procedures for requesting personal information from drivers 259 or pedestrians during a stop, including:
- (a) When the motor vehicle has been stopped solely for a traffic violation, a peace officer shall only request the following documentation from drivers of motor vehicles: a driver's license or other verifiable, government-issued identification, including foreign-issued identification; motor vehicle registration; and proof of insurance, unless there exists reasonable suspicion or probable cause of criminal activity;
- 267 (b) No passenger of a motor vehicle shall be requested to provide 268 identification or any other documentation by a peace officer when the 269 motor vehicle has been stopped solely for a traffic violation, unless 270 there exists reasonable suspicion or probable cause of criminal activity; 271 and
 - (c) When a pedestrian has been stopped based on reasonable suspicion of criminal activity, a peace officer shall only request the first, middle, and last name and address of the individual stopped.
 - 8. Each law enforcement agency shall create a community and

280

281

282283

284

285

286

287

288

289290

299

300

301

302

law enforcement partnership to create mutual understanding between law enforcement and the community about biased policing and to provide a forum for each group to listen and respond to the other's concerns. The partnership:

- (1) Shall include no less than five participants composed of representatives of law enforcement, community leaders, and educational leaders who reflect the diversity of the local community;
- (2) Shall facilitate workshops and public meetings in the community on racial and other biases;
- (3) May advise and assist in policy development and the training and education of law enforcement agencies on biased policing;
- (4) Shall annually and formally recognize law enforcement agencies and individual officers who have demonstrated strong commitment to addressing issues of biased policing and working with the local community.
- 9. (1) All law enforcement agencies shall be trained by the POST 291 292 commission on issues related to the prohibition of biased policing, on data collection and reporting methods, and on the policies mandated 293 in subsection 7 of this section. The commission shall develop and 294 disseminate guidelines and training on this section for peace 295 296 officers. The course or courses of instruction and the guidelines shall 297 stress development of effective, non-combative methods of carrying out 298 law enforcement duties in a diverse environment.
 - (2) The course of basic training for peace officers shall include adequate instruction on diverse communities in order to foster mutual respect and cooperation between law enforcement and members of all diverse communities.
- 303 (3) In developing and establishing criteria for the training, the 304 POST commission shall consult with appropriate groups and 305 individuals having an interest and expertise in the fields of implicit 306 bias, biased policing, civil rights, cultural awareness and diversity.
- 307 (4) Every peace officer shall participate in a one-time training 308 as prescribed and certified by the POST commission. The course of 309 instruction shall include:
- 310 (a) Identification of key indices and perspectives that make up 311 differences among residents in a local community;
- 312 (b) Negative impact of implicit and explicit biases, prejudices,

SB 976

and stereotyping on effective law enforcement, including examination of how historical perceptions of discriminatory enforcement practices have harmed police and community relations;

- 316 (c) The history and the role of the civil rights movement and 317 struggles and their impact on law enforcement;
- 318 (d) Specific obligations of peace officers in preventing, reporting, 319 and responding to discriminatory or biased practices by fellow officers; 320 and
 - (e) Perspectives of diverse, local constituency groups, and experts on particular cultural and police and community relations issues in a local area.
 - (5) Once the initial one-time training is completed, each peace officer shall be required to complete an annual training course that reviews the topics listed in subdivision (4) of this subsection.
- [6.] 10. (1) If a law enforcement agency fails to comply with the provisions of this section, the governor [may] shall withhold any state funds appropriated to the noncompliant law enforcement agency.
 - (2) If a law enforcement agency reports a motor vehicle or pedestrian stop or consent search disparity index for any particular minority group that is one standard deviation above the corresponding statewide indices for that same minority group for three consecutive years, the agency shall be subject to review for a period of three years.
 - (3) During the time an agency is subject to review, the agency shall provide semi-annual reports on biased policing to the attorney general, which shall include the same information required in subsection 4 of this section and a narrative form describing what effort or action, if any, has been taken to address any racial disparities in stops and searches. The report shall be a public record.
 - (4) If a law enforcement agency reports a motor vehicle, pedestrian stop, or consent search disparity index that is one standard deviation or more above the statewide indices in its second year of review, the attorney general shall require changes in the agency's policies and practices, including techniques for identifying problem officers, requirements that an officer's profiling statistics be a part of the record used to evaluate promotions and reassignments, training of supervisors in the skills necessary to eliminate biased policing, and increasing the quality and quantity of officer training related to biased

353

354

355

356

357 358

359 360

361 362

363

364 365

366

379

380 381

384

policing. The attorney general's office shall work with other state agencies to provide financial assistance and expertise to facilitate these changes.

- (5) If a law enforcement agency reports a motor vehicle, pedestrian stop, or consent search disparity index that is one standard deviation or more above the statewide indices in its third year of review, in addition to loss of state funds, the POST commission, in consultation with the attorney general's office, shall review the record of the law enforcement agency during the review period to determine if the pattern of disparities is the result of low samples of statistical data or if it indicates a systemic bias or a failure to supervise of such magnitude that the law enforcement agency should be decertified. The POST commission shall take into account whether the agency is making a good faith effort to reform. If not decertified, the agency shall remain under review, with periodic POST commission oversight, until such time as the agency's disparity and consent search rate indices are no longer one standard deviation or more above the statewide indices.
- 11. (1) An individual subject to biased policing practices or an organization whose interests are germane to the purpose of this section, may enforce this section in a civil action for any or all of the following remedies: compensatory and punitive damages; injunctive and declaratory relief; and such other relief as a court deems appropriate.
- 373 (2) In an action brought under this section, relief may be 374 obtained against:
- 375 (a) Any governmental body that employed the peace officer who 376 engaged in biased policing;
- 377 (b) Any peace officer who engaged in biased policing practices 378 and any person with supervisory authority over such peace officer;
 - (c) Any civilian employee who is employed with a law enforcement agency who engaged in biased policing practices and any person with supervisory authority over such civilian employee; and
- 382 (d) Any party contracted by the law enforcement agency who 383 engaged in biased policing practices.
 - (3) A violation of this section is established when:
- 385 (a) An individual or organization brings an action demonstrating 386 that a peace officer has, or peace officers have, intentionally engaged

SB 976 12

396

397

401

407

408

409

410

411

413

387 in biased policing of one or more individuals; and

- 388 (b) The governmental body, peace officer, or supervisor against 389 whom such action is brought fails to prove that:
- 390 a. Such biased policing is necessary to achieve a compelling 391 governmental interest; and
- 392 b. The practice was narrowly tailored to achieve that compelling governmental interest; and 393
- 394 c. The least restrictive means were used to achieve the 395 compelling governmental interest.
 - (4) Alternatively, a violation of this section is established when:
- (a) An individual or organization brings an action demonstrating that the activities of peace officers have had a disparate impact on 398 399 individuals based on actual or perceived race, ethnicity, religion, national origin, age, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, 400 language, or disability; and
- 402 (b) The governmental body, peace officer, or supervisor against 403 whom such action is brought fails to prove a compelling governmental interest for such activities; or 404
- 405 (c) The governmental body, peace officer, or supervisor does 406 prove a compelling governmental interest for such activities; and
 - (d) The individual or organization demonstrates a comparably effective alternative policy or practice which results in less of a disparate impact.
- (5) In any action or proceeding to enforce this section against any governmental body, the court shall allow a prevailing plaintiff 412reasonable attorney's fees as part of the costs, and may include expert witness fees as part of the attorney's fees.
- 414 [7.] 12. Each law enforcement agency in this state may utilize federal 415 funds from community-oriented policing services grants or any other federal sources to equip each vehicle used for traffic stops with a video camera and 416 voice-activated microphone. 417
- 418 [8.] 13. A peace officer who stops a driver of a motor vehicle pursuant to 419 a lawfully conducted sobriety check point or road block shall be exempt from the reporting requirements of subsection [2] 4 of this section. 420
- 421 14. If any provision of this section, or amendments thereto, shall 422 be held invalid or ineffective in whole or in part or inapplicable to any 423 person or situation, such holding shall not affect, impair or invalidate

SB 976

424 any portion of or the remainder of this section, and all other provisions

425 thereof shall nevertheless be separately and fully effective and the

426 application of any such provision to other persons or situations shall

427 not be affected.

/

Unofficial

Bill

Copy